"Alone stand I.":

The strange case of the troubadour Arnaut Daniel and the trobar clus



A close-up on a Hawthorn Hedge (the inspiration for my piece), from Getty Images

Lord Ishmael Stedfast Reed

Jocs Floral Poetry Competition

Atlantian 12th Night 2021

A.S. LV

Table of Contents

Original Poem	3
Executive Summary	4
Historical Context: Arnaut Daniel and the <i>trobar clus</i>	4
Troubadour Love Poetry and "L'aur amara"	6
"Alone stand I.", My Original Work on Poetic Love for the 21st Century	7
Conclusion and Discussion	8
Bibliography	9
Appendix A	10

"Alone stand I.", after Arnaut Daniel's "L'aur amara", c. 1200

Alone stand I. Here, mother-die Thy keening cry, Mem'ry surrounds, Bloomed all around May Queen uncrowned, Doth ring! Biting Last spring. My love, whispering low, Nightingale in late snow, 'Mid mistral's fangéd blow; Unseen Seem'd keen, Thy scene Claws Cause Draws On III-Favor's paws; For blossoming haws, From my mind due pause The past's fell hounds, Sweet without bounds! At thy renown. Cheer Near Clear, In the drear. From thee, dear! Must I steer Deep, thy absence Along the fence From sour pretense Is an aching Green and flow'ring, That I might wring Quickthorn Reborn Rough-shorn Which hedges me I'd lie with thee. Fruit from a tree Within a lonely vale, Now Flora's charms do fail: Whose branches elsewhere While I'm dying There is nothing trail: For thy sun's smile in my But cockspurs, my throat Whitethorn's brief sting to tie. Fades come Spring, spirit's sky. ********* ally. I look and sigh over the grounds, But hist! Hard by Like a maid shy, Philomel sounds, Dawn peeks sky-bound, Floating Ghost-like in cagéd woe And wings Wellspring Of hope in Prime's first glow! Between From nest of may buds. No "Was" Athene Serene And all of my flaws Vase Laws Should show the true cause "Shan't be" expounds. Of Nature's First Cause Jeer. Of her unbound Spin a new round End-of-Year! Year. Fear, Thy cold offense Though the ear May's premiere Is weakening Too well can sense Is the incense And worn, Why she must sing: Which floret's bring; To mourn, This morn Compared to she from whose leaving I quail: With grim beauty, I am set free Thy chill coiling Her bitter, vengeful tale: From self-lashing travail: Heaven be, were she The vile lapwing, No longer cling nearby. From whose violence she To what might have been, or must fly. why. ******** ******* *******

> Go I now hence Chained by nothing; Reborn From Loss' debris Rises poet Ishmael, And this I sing: Thou thy own Self dignify.

Executive Summary

"Alone stand I" is a new poem directly modeled after the period exemplar, Arnaut Daniel's "L'aur amara" (The bitter breeze). Its form and function copies the intricate rhyme and structure of the *trobar clus* style that Daniel was a master of, while attempting to add contemporary commentary on the pitfalls of the traditional poetic love-lorn speaker in the exemplar. Finally, although the original piece was written in the 12th century in Provençal, much of the language and imagery of my own piece is inspired by Ishmael Stedfast Reed's 16th century English romantic sense.

Historical Context: Arnaut Daniel and the trobar clus

Arnaut Daniel is a fascinating historical figure. A traveling troubadour from the end of the 12th century, he is given the credit for the invention of the sestina, a famously complicated poetic form involving a rotating series of repeated ending words ("Arnaut"). This attribution makes perfect sense for a leading poet of the *trobar clus*, or "closed verse" style, defined by the online Encyclopedia of Medieval Literature as "a style...characterized by deliberate obscurity, metrical complexity, allusive and difficult language, and intricacy of rhyme schemes" ("trobar clus"). It seemed to come from a desire to direct work at a courtly, well-read audience, who might better appreciate the virtuosity of their complicated works. They were, as author S.C. Hickman describes, "respected performers among the aristocracy". Daniel's mastery was such that, even centuries later, he was considered a giant in the poetic world. 100 years after Arnaut Daniel stopped writing, Dante famously placed Daniel in the *Purgatorio*. In it, Dante labeled him a "greater craftsman of the mother tongue" (XXVI, 117) whose "love songs... /[were] without peer" (XXVI, 118-119). Arnaut Daniel then gives a speech written in Provençal (the only break from Dante's Italian verse in the whole *Comedy*), although my translation of *The Divine Comedy* renders this speech in Middle English to achieve the same effect (Alighieri 515). Clearly this was a significant figure for Dante to give him the unique honor of allowing him to "speak" in his native language.

And in fact, a survey of Arnaut's works confirms his mastery of, and adherence to, the *trobar clus*. Normally, French and adjacent-language poetry is syllabic and uses lots of rhyme, using a consistent number of syllables and repeating sounds to maintain a beat -- which Arnaut regularly plays with to achieve fascinating syncopation unusual in this time period.

For example, in his poem "Quan chai la fuelha", each stanza's lines have 5, 6, 5, 6 then 4, 7, 4, 7 syllables. He maintains a fairly regular ABAB BABA 2-rhyme scheme in this piece, splitting the stanza into two slightly different "flavors". The first two stanzas are reprinted below for you to count, so you can see this is an intentional choice, rather than some accident:

```
Quan/ chai/ la/ fuel/ha
dels/ aus/sors/ en/tres/sims
el/ freg/ s'er/guel/ha
don / se /ca 'l /vais /e'l /vims,
del/ dous/ re/ frims
vei/ sor/ dez /ir/ la /bruel/ha:
mais /ieu/ sui/ prims
d'Am/or/ qui/ que/ s'en/ tuel/ha.
Tot/ quan/ es /ge/la,
mas/ ieu/ no/ puesc /fre/zir
qu'a/mors/ nov/el/a
mi/ fa'l /cor /re /ver /dir;
non /dei/ fre/mir
qu'A/mors/ mi /cue/br'em/ ce/la
em /fai /ten/ir
ma/ va/lor/ em /cap/de/la
```

The exemplar poem my own work is based on, "L'aur amara", is *much* further afield. A prime example of the true master of *trobar clus*, Arnaut Daniel wrote this poem with an overwhelming 11-rhyme scheme which only repeats each stanza, rather than many internal repetitions to help maintain a beat. Further, the syllable counts stray much wider than the 4-7 range from the previous work at 1 to 7. Here is the first stanza and the final coda of the poem:

L'aur amara	4, A
fa'ls bruels brancutz	4, B
Clarzir,	2, C
que'l dous'espeis'ab fuelhs,	6, D
e'ls letz	2, E
Becx	1, F
dels auzels ramencx	5, F
te babs e mutz,	4, B
Pars	1, G
e non pars,	3, G
per que m'esfortz	4, H
per far e dir	4,C
Plazers	2, I
a manhs per lei	4, J
qui m'a virat bas d'aut,	6, K
don tem morir	4, C
si l'afans no m'asoma.	7, A

x 5 + the CODA, a half-stanza that ties up the poem by repeated the second half of the stanza pattern once more:

Fez es l'acrotz:	4, F
qu'el cor remir	4,C
totz sers	2, I
lieis cui dompnei,	4, J
ses parsonier <u>Arnaut,</u>	6, K
qu'en autr'albir	4, C
n'esfort m'entent'a soi	ma. 7, A

The full poem "L'aur amara" in its original Provençal, as well as two different translations for comparison, can be found in Appendix A. Matching 11 different rhymes in English each stanza with such syllable restrictions is no easy feat, and I am not surprised that only a few poets like Ezra Pound took the challenge to translate the piece and *also* maintain the original rhyme and rhythm.

Troubadour Love Poetry and "L'aur amara"

"L'aur amara" follows the common poetic trope of a speaker out of favor with his revered love, a topic as popular in the 12th century as the 16th, across much of the poetic landscape. Fascinatingly, there are many comparisons between Daniel's poetry here and Arabic verse, which may have reached Provence through Iberia. "The Iberian Peninsula, the meeting point of France and Spain (the Pyrenees), harbored an exchange of culture in the twelfth century" (Hickman).

For a one small interesting parallel, both the Arabic *ghazal* style and many of Daniel's poems (including "Laur amara") include the "takhallus" or self-naming device, in which the poet names themselves in the poem ("Ghazal"): Daniel's coda includes the line "ses parsonier Arnaut" (113). More widely, both the *ghazal* and Daniel's poetry seems to focus more on a more loose collection of images and feelings, rather than one coherent narrative. For example, Hafiz writes:

"O beautiful wine-bearer, bring forth the cup and put it to my lips Path of love seemed easy at first, what came was many hardships. With its perfume, the morning breeze unlocks those beautiful locks The curl of those dark ringlets, many hearts to shreds strips."

The first two lines establish the image of a cup-bearer passing around wine, but quickly shift in the next couplet to describing the "perfume" of the "morning breeze" and the "locks" of a missing lover (2). The connection seems to be that the speaker in the poem is reminiscing about the love that is now having "difficulties" (1). Similarly, Arnaut Daniel's poem shifts each stanza, between images of "wandering birds" in "the bitter air" in stanza 1, to the more religiously connoted brightness of "my first enlightenment" in stanza 2, and the physical sense of needing "remedies" like "a kiss my hot / heart to refresh" in the third. In the essay "Forbidden Desire: Arnaut Daniel, Mathematician and Troubadour", Hickman explains:

"Many characteristics of love, as expressed by the troubadours, are found in the lyrical tradition which originated among the *Udhri* poets of the seventh-century Arabia: the elevation of a lady into an object of veneration, humble submission to her capricious tyranny, the emphasis on the need for secrecy, the idea of love as a source of moral and social refinement, and belief in love's potentially destructive power." (Hickman)

And in fact many of these ideas are discernible in "L'aur amara". Daniel writes how "my firm, strong heart / makes me conceal" (45-46), and that he is "serving her" and "Devoted" (33-34).

"Alone stand I.", My Original Work on Poetic Love for the 21st Century

I found one problem as a poet that I wanted to tackle with my own piece. I find this characteristic "chivalric" worship/enslavement to a disinterested woman to be a problematic, sometimes dangerous, expectation to place. Hundreds of think-pieces have been written since the birth of the #MeToo movement to unpack how, as far back as the middle ages, the idolatry and self-flagellation of 'nice guys' has led to bitter and resentful gender relations and a normalization of harassment as a demonstration of romantic commitment. Even worse, the false expectation of sexual fulfillment (Daniel's "a kiss my hot / heart to refresh") in exchange for this behavior. To combat this thematic content, my own romantic speaker gives up his moaning and submission to the distant lover in favor of self-love and dignity.

My piece centers around the hawthorn, a "consistent symbol of carnal love" according to Susan Eberly in "A Thorn Among Lilies: The Hawthorn in Medieval Love Allegory". She goes on to provide examples from multiple poetic sources, such as the 'Court of Love' which describes "the floures fresh and branch and blome / and namely hawthorne brought both page and chrome" as part of a May day tradition. In Chaucer's "Knight's Tale", too, Arcite "maken hym a gerland of the greves / were it of modebynde or of hawthorne leves" in order to woo Emily, his chivalric love. And so my own piece uses the cycle of the hawthorn plant, which has thorns, berries, and buds, to represent the cycle of wounding and healing the speaker must go through to get out of what I consider a toxic cycle or worship and disillusionment. My speaker begins "[hedged]" (14) by "quickthorn" (13) (one of the many names for hawthorn in English which is sharp like "claws" (6) of "the past's fell hounds" 8)), alluding to its major purpose as a thick, thorny hedgerow in England. Spiritually and physically, the speaker is confined by sharp pains of love unreturned. This jibes with Eberly's description of "hawthorn,[which speaks] to us... of the separation that occurs when humankind chooses carnal love to the exclusion of spiritual love." (47).

However, like the hawthorn's bare spikes are renewed with clusters of bright berries come spring, and green again, so too does my speaker find themselves renewed, not by a new lover, but by a new love of the self. He finds the dawn to be "like a maid shy" (86), his "wellspring / of hope" (88-89), hinting that he has taken the natural refreshment of the world to be his new "maid" rather than some new object of affection. The hawthorn naturally has a strong-smelling blossom, which my speaker describes as "the incense / which floret's bring" (96-97), demonstrating the connection between the spiritual and physical: winter's "cold offense / is weakening" (29-30) and making way for "Spring, spirit's ally" (85).

This transition in mindset is precipitated by symbolism. The speaker doesn't think the "fruit" (82) is meant for him: he realizes in a turn that it is "pretense" to think he could "wring / rough-shorn" love from someone who does not want him back, here symbolized as bruising fruit when picking it from a plant (79 - 84). My piece presents this idea with the Classical connection between nightingales, which summers in English hedge ("Nightingale"), and Philomel.

Philomel was an Athenian princess who, the story goes, was raped by her brother-in-law Tereus. Tereus "was... / pricked on by his lustful nature" (Ovid 6.458) and, in Ovid's hideously physical description, ties her up and cuts out her tongue so she cannot tell anyone what happened

(6.550-556). After a vengeful confrontation between Philomel, her sister Procne, and Tereus, the Gods intervened: "they were suspended on wing. [Philomel] transformed to a nightingale, / made for the forest" (6.668-669). Procne was turned into a swallow, and Tereus into a "hoopoe" (6.673), reimagined as the "lappewincke" (6041) as John Gower retells it in his 14th c. work *Confessio Amantis or Tales of the Seven Deadly Sins*, to warn against the dangers of lust. I chose to use the lapwing rather than the hoopoe to maintain image consistency with the English environment.

And so in my piece, the hidden gem in the thorny hawthorn hedge is the nightingale's famously beautiful song, which the speaker hears as "Philomel sounds" (53) by which he can "sense / Why she must sing: / To mourn / With grim beauty, / Her bitter, vengeful tale: The vile lapwing, / From whose violence she must fly" (42-48). This story connection in the speaker's mind helps him to realize that, in insisting on pursuing this love interest who has left him, he is not so different from Tereus, "pricked" by his own internal thorns to commit atrocities. Although yes, in the past the speaker (identified as Ishmael in the piece, but certainly isn't exactly me) did "Last spring / My love... Lie with thee" (37-48), that time has passed, and he mustn't "cling / To what might have been, or why" (84-85).

Conclusion and Discussion

Ultimately I think "Alone stand I." is one of the more difficult pieces I have tackled yet. I have always been attracted to the metric and rhyming schemes of period poets from Provence to Persia, but Arnaut Daniel's form for "L'aur amara" is positively unique in Period, from what I can tell. Tackling it in English, which has *many* more ending sounds and less room for elision was such an interesting puzzle. I did have to stretch a few sounds into imperfect rhymes, and strain English grammatically flexibility to its limit, but it is otherwise very close to the original.

I chose to focus on a more narratively coherent, somewhat chronological structure for my poem, rather than the more pondering nature of Daniel's original, and for the same reason as my other changes: adapting the form of the *trobar clus* for a contemporary listening and reading audience. Inspired by post-Period poems like "Ode to a Nightingale" by Keats and "The Darkling Thrush" by Hardy, I thought having some consistent natural world to visualize, or actions to follow as the speaker thinks, would really helps the modern reader comprehend some of the more opaque syntax and technical elements, like the classical allusion. I also significantly changed some of the thematic elements from the original, to poetically comment on the weaknesses of the original conception of love.

Working with this particular troubadour poet has helped me realize how wide the world of troubadour poetry is, and to continue in the *trobar clus* style! In the future, I'd like to better match the images and themes of Continental writers, rather than sticking to period English verse -- the hawthorn hedge, lapwing and nightingale, and language like "thou" and "thee" are particular to my comfort with the English poetic landscape.

Works Cited

- Alighieri, Dante. "The Purgatorio". *The Divine Comedy*, translated by John Ciardi, New American Library, New York, NY, 2003.
- Daniel, Arnaut. "L'aura Amara", translated by Ezra Pound, *Allpoetry.com*. https://allpoetry.com/poem/13555302-Laura-Amara-by-Ezra-Pound
- Daniel, Arnaut. "Quan chai la fuelha (When the leaf sings)", from Arnaut Daniel: Complete Works, *trobar.org*, http://www.trobar.org/troubadours/arnaut_daniel/arnaut_daniel_01.php
- Daniel, Arnaut. "L'aur amara (The bitter air)", from Arnaut Daniel, Complete Works, trobar.org, http://www.trobar.org/troubadours/arnaut_daniel/arnaut_daniel_13.php
- Eberly, Susan S. "A Thorn Among Lillies: The Hawthorn in Medieval Love Allegory, *Folklore*, Vol 100, No. 1, pp. 41-52, 1989, accessed via JSTOR. https://www.jstor.org/stable/1259999
- Gower, John. *Confessio Amatis*, *Tales of the Seven Deadly Sins*, *1330-1408 A.D.*, edited by Prof. G.C. Macauley, accessed via Project Gutenberg, 2008. http://www.gutenberg.org/files/266/266-h/266-h.htm
- "Ghazal". *Princeton Encyclopedia of Poetry and Poetics*. 4th ed. Edited by Roland Greene et al. Princeton University Press. 2012.
- "Hawthorn". *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, March 12, 2020. https://www.britannica.com/plant/hawthorn
- Hickman, S.C. "Forbidden Desire: Arnaut Daniel, Mathematician and Troubadour", *Dr. Rinaldi's Horror Cabinet*, 2012. https://socialecologies.wordpress.com/2012/12/23/forbidden-desire-arnaut-daniel-mathematician-and-troubadour/
- "Nightingale". *RSPB.org*, The Royal Society for the Protection of Birds,.

 https://www.rspb.org.uk/birds-and-wildlife/wildlife-guides/bird-a-z/nightingale/#:~:text=ln%20the%20UK%20they%20breed,again%20from%20July%20to%20August.
- Ovid. Metamorphoses, translated by David Raeburn, Penguin Books, London: 2004.
- Shirazi, Hafez. "Ghazal 1". Translated by Shahriari, Shariar. *Hafiz On Love*. Hafizonlove.com. 1999. https://www.hafizonlove.com/divan/01/001.htm
- "trobar clus". *Encyclopedia of medieval literature*, Enacademic.com, 2013. https://medieval_literature.enacademic.com/597/trobar_clus

Appendix A: "L'aur amara" by Arnaut Daniel

	T	T
"L'aur Amara" Original	Arnaut Daniel: Complete Works	"L'aura Amara"
Text	Translation	translated by Ezra Pound
L'aur amara	The bitter air	The bitter air
fa'ls bruels brancutz	makes those bough-laden woods	
clarzir,	barren,	Strips panoply
que'l dous'espeis'ab	which the sweet one thickens with	From trees
fuelhs,	leaves,	Where softer winds set leaves,
e'ls letz	and the gleeful	And glad,
becx	beaks	Beaks
dels auzels ramencx	of the wandering birds	Now in brakes are coy,
		Scarce peep that wee
te babs e mutz,	it keeps stammering and dumb,	Mates
pars	couples	And un-mates.
e non pars,	and single ones,	What gaud's the work?
per que m'esfortz	therefore I endeavour	
per far e dir	to act and speak	What good the glees?
plazers	pleasantly	What curse
a manhs per lei	to many for the sake of her	I strive to shake!
qui m'a virat bas d'aut,	who has cast me low from high,	Me hath she cast from high,
don tem morir	for whom I dread to die	In fell disease
si l'afans no m'asoma.	if my grievance isn't eased.	I lie, and deathly fearing.
Tan fo clara	So bright it was,	So clear the flare
ma prima lutz	my first enlightenment	That first lit me
d'eslir	in choosing	
lei don cre'l cors los	her about whom my heart believes my	To seize
huelhs,	eyes,	Her whom my soul believes;
non pretz	I don't care for	If cad
necx	secret	Sneaks,
mans dos aigovencx	inviting becks	Blabs, slanders, my joy
d'autra, s'esdutz	of another woman, if she turns away	Counts little fee
rars	my rare	Baits
mos preiars:	entreats:	And their hates.
pero deportz	but it is joy	I scorn their perk
m'es ad auzir	to me to hear	And preen, at ease.
volers;	her wish;	Disburse
bos motz segrei	I shall follow the fair words	
de lieis don tan m'azaut	of her who has taken me so much	Can she, and wake
gu'al sieu servir	that in serving her	Such firm delights, That I
sei del pe tro c'al coma.	I am [devoted] from head to toe.	Am hers, froth, lees Bigod! from toe to earring.
Amors, guara!	Hist, Love!	bigou: from toe to earning.
sui be vengutz?	am I welcome?	Amor, look yare!
Cauzir	To display,	Know certainly
tem far, si'm dezacuelhs	I fear, if you repel me,	The keys:
tal detz	such words	
		How she thy suit receives;
pecx,	(ill)	No add
que t'es mielhs que't	that you'd better cut this,	Piques.
trencx,	since I'm a faithful lover,	'Twere folly to annoy
qu'ieu sui fis drutz,	dear	I'm true, so dree
cars	and not fleeting;	Fates;
e non vars;	but my firm, strong heart	No debates
ma'l cors ferm fortz	makes me conceal	Shake me, nor jerk,
me fai cobrir	in many directions that,	My verities
mainhs vers,	albeit I deny it,	
qu'ap tot lo nei,	I'd need a kiss my hot	Turn terse,
m'agr' ops us bais al caut	heart to refresh,	And yet I ache;
cor refrezir,	since other remedies are useless.	Her lips, not snows that fly
que no'i val autra goma.		Have potencies
	If he agrees,	To slake, to cool my searing.
Si m'ampara,	he who is tormenting me,	
silh que'm trautz,	to make me closer	Behold my prayer,
1		

d'aizir to that epitome of worth, (Or company qui es de pretz capduelhs, of the mute Of these) dels quetz pravers Seeks whom such height achieves; which huddle inside me precx Well clad qu'ai dedins a rencx shall be made to her Seeks l'er for rendutz clear Her, and would not cloy. clare my thoughts: Heart apertly mos pensars: that I would be dead States quieu fora mortz but it helps me endure Thought, Hope waits mas fa'm sufrir that expectation 'Gainst death to irk: l'espers which I endear her to shorten, False brevities que'lh prec que'm brei, which alone keeps me gay and joyful, And worse! qu'aisso'm te let e baut, since of other joys que d'als jauzir none's worth a minnow. To her I raik. non val jois un poma. Sole her; all others' dry Sweet visage, Felicities laden with all qualities, Doussa car'a I count not worth the leering. totz aips volgutz, to endure sofrir from your hands shall be pride, Ah, fair face, where, Each quality m'er per vos manhs since you are erquelhs, the end One pride-shaft more, that cleaves quar etz of all my follies, Me; mad frieks decx because of which I have suffered many (O' thy beck) destroy, de totz mos fadencx i 7 7 And mockery don ai manhs brutz slander; Baits pars; but scoffing Me. and rates. doesn't turn me from you e quabars Yet I not shirk de vos no'm tortz nor makes me part [from you] ni'm fai partir wealth, Thy velleities, avers, since never have I loved Averse c'anc non amei with less vanity anything: Me not, nor slake ren tan amens d'ufaut, rather, I long for you Desire. God draws not nigh ans vos dezir more than those of Doma long for God. To Dome, with pleas plus que Dieu silh de Doma. Wherein's so little veering. Now get ready, you Ara't para, lyrics and song, Now chant prepare, chans e condutz, to show And melody fornir before the king that welcomes you, To please al rei qui te rucuelhs, since Worth, The king, who'll judge thy sheaves. quar Pretz, blind here, is doubled there, Worth, sad, secx sai, lai es doblencx, and kept is Sneaks e mantegutz the habit of giving gifts Here; double employ and food: dars Hath there. Get thee gladly I bring you there. e maniars: Plates de joi la't portz. Ah, for her wondrous ring Full, and cates, son anel mir to behold! Gifts, go! Nor lurk si'l ders, Never have I been Here till decrees qu'anc non estei far from Aragon without, all of a Reverse, jorn d'Araguo que'l saut sudden. And ring thou take no'i volques ir; craving to go there; Straight t'Arago I'd ply mas sai m'an clamat: but here they have shouted: "Stay!" Cross the wide seas "roma!" But 'Rome' disturbs my hearing. The rhymes are done: Fez es l'acrotz: let the heart behold At midnight mirk qu'el cor remir every night totz sers her who suits In secrecies lieis cui dompnei, her absent Arnaut, I nurse since in other thought ses parsonier Arnaut, My served make gu'en autr'albir I cannot put my whole will. In heart; nor try n'esfort m'entent'a soma. My melodies At other's door not mearing.